Moral Reasoning & Ethical Judgment: Level I

Student’s Name ____________________________ Assessor’s Name ____________________________
Graduation Year ________________ Date ________________

The **Level One** student will:

- Employ ethical concepts and reasoning when presented with model ethical cases in medicine
- Be able to recognize ethical issues in medical practice and identify most relevant ethical considerations in them.

A. Recognizes ethical issues and identifies alternatives in difficult ethical choices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unaware of ethical issues and alternative choices in regard to the care of the individual patient, the community and fellow professionals; is not cognizant of the effects of differing values, obligations, moral rights and personal principles in choices</td>
<td>Can recognize and identify ethical issues and alternative choices in regard to the care of the individual patient, the community and fellow professionals; is aware of the effect of differing values, obligations, moral rights and personal principles in choices</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Good understanding of ethical issues and alternative choices in regard to the care of the individual patient, the community, and fellow professionals; well aware of the effect of differing values, obligations, moral rights and personal principles in choices</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

B. Systematically analyzes and defends ethical choices in the treatment of the patient

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Obtains incomplete medical information relevant to the ethical treatment of the patient; cannot determine ethical values, obligations, and rights implicit in the treatment plan; confused about alternatives; hesitant to select and defend actions</td>
<td>Obtains medical information relevant to the ethical treatment of the patient; determines ethical values, obligations, and rights implicit in the treatment plan; can weight alternatives, select and defend actions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Routinely gathers the most appropriate medical information relevant to the ethical treatment of the patient; completely aware of ethical values, obligations, and rights implicit in the treatment plan; superbly weights alternatives, selects and defends actions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C. Determines, articulates, and analyzes ethical issues in health policy and relations with other medical professionals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Seem oblivious to the role of institutional frameworks and practices in determining care; unaware of ethical considerations implicit in health policy issues and choices; does not know how ethical norms, rules and guidelines of professional societies can effect choices</td>
<td>Is aware of the role of institutional frameworks and practices in determining care; can recite ethical considerations implicit in health policy issues and choices; is aware of the role of ethical norms, rules and guidelines of professional societies in effecting choices</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Keenly aware of the role of institutional frameworks and practices in determining care; fully understands ethical considerations implicit in health policy issues and choices; fully cognizant of the role ethical norms, rules and guidelines of professional societies can play in choices</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

D. Identifies relevant case and statutory law bearing on ethical choices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is unaware that states vary in regard to laws affecting health care and the duties of health care professionals; does not understand the alternatives in health practice permitted or proscribed by law</td>
<td>Is aware that states vary in regard to laws affecting health care and the duties of health care professionals; is aware of the alternatives in health practice permitted or proscribed by law</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Understands and can recite how this state varies from others in regard to laws affecting health care and the duties of health care professionals; acutely aware of the alternatives in health practice permitted or proscribed by law</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Over
E. Applies ethical information to the treatment of individual patients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Has difficulty obtaining a valid consent or refusal of treatment; cannot evaluate patient’s capacity to refuse treatment or when to withhold information; has difficulty with terminal illness</td>
<td>Understands how to obtain valid consent or refusal of treatment; able to evaluate patient’s capacity to refuse treatment; able to decide when to withhold information; able to treat patients with terminal illness in ethical manner</td>
<td>Thorough understanding of how to obtain a valid consent or refusal of treatment, excellent at evaluating patient’s capacity to refuse treatment and proceeds correctly with incapacitated patients; withholds information appropriately; the ethics of terminal illness presents no difficulties</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

F. Recognizes and effectively deals with unethical behavior in other health care professionals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ignores unethical behavior; unaware of institutional methods, policies, and resources available to address unethical behavior</td>
<td>Can identify unethical behavior and suggests corrective action; knows institutional methods, policies, and resources available to address unethical behavior</td>
<td>Identifies unethical behavior and suggests the most appropriate corrective action; keenly aware of institutional methods, policies, and resources available to address unethical behavior</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please average the scores from each of the activities that you assessed [e.g., \((A + B + C + D + E + F) ÷ 6\)]

Average Score  

Comments: